QCD thermodynamics
Frithjof Karsch, BNL/Bielefeld

Key Questions
NSAC Long Range Plan 2007

- What are the phases of strongly interacting matter, and what role do they play in the cosmos?
- What does QCD predict for the properties of strongly interacting matter?
- What governs the transition of quarks and gluons into pions and nucleons?

recent reviews:
H.-T. Ding, F. Karsch, S. Mukherjee, Thermodynamics of strong-interaction matter from Lattice QCD arXiv:1504.05274
U. Heinz et al., Exploring the properties of the phases of QCD matter - research opportunities and priorities for the next decade, arXiv:1501.06477
Exploring the QCD phase diagram

controlled by the QCD equation of state, $T_c$

expectation: freeze-out close to QCD transition line

observable consequences: freeze-out pattern of mesons and baryons, controlled by $T_f, \mu_B, \mu_S$

– LHC: establish contact with the QCD PHASE transition

– RHIC: locate/provide evidence for the QCD critical point

$T_{pc} = 154(9)\text{MeV}$

$\mu_B = 2T_f$

$\mu_B = 3T_f$
Outline

• QCD thermodynamics projects in 2014/15
• Equation of state and transition temperature
  – continuum extrapolated EoS at $\mu_B = 0$;
  – insight into the role of topology close to $T_c$
  – EoS at non-zero net-baryon density and the BES@RHIC

• Charge fluctuations and the RHIC search for the critical point
  – evidence for many new strange and charmed baryons
  – using electric charge fluctuations to search for the critical point
  – characterization of freeze-out conditions using conserved charge fluctuations
Thermodynamics projects in 2014/15

Equation of state and the transition temperature:

A. Bazavov et al. (hotQCD), *Equation of State in (2+1)-flavor QCD*, Phys. Rev. D90 (2014) 094503


Fluctuation of conserved charges using Taylor expansions:


In-medium meson properties

A. Bazavov et al., *In-medium modifications of open and hidden strange-charm mesons from spatial correlation functions*, Phys. Rev. D91 (2015) 054503

Y. Maezawa et al., *Meson screening masses at finite temperature with Highly Improved Staggered Quarks*, arXiv:1312.4375
Lattice meets Experiment in 2014/15

Workshops/Programs on Heavy Ion Physics:


– RHIC users' meeting: Beam Energy Scan workshop, BNL, June 10, 2015, organizers: S. Mukherjee, D. McDonald, J. Mitchell

International Conference and Workshop Series:

– Extreme QCD
  2015: CCNU Wuhan, China, Sept. 21-23, 2015, co-organizers: H.-T. Ding, F. Karsch.....

– Critical Point and Onset of Deconfinement
Equation of state of (2+1)-flavor QCD

A. Bazavov et al. (hotQCD), Phys. Rev. D90 (2014) 094503

\[ \mu_B = \mu_S = \mu_Q = 0 \]

– consistent with results from Budapest-Wuppertal (stout): S. Borsanyi et al., PL B730, 99 (2014)

– up to the crossover region the QCD EoS agrees quite well with hadron resonance gas (HRG) model calculations; However, QCD results are systematically above HRG
Crossover transition parameters

PDG: Particle Data Group hadron spectrum

\[ T_c = (154 \pm 9) \text{ MeV} \]
\[ \epsilon_c = (0.34 \pm 0.16) \text{GeV/fm}^3 \]

compare with:
\[ \epsilon_{\text{nucl. mat.}} \approx 150 \text{ MeV/fm}^3 \]
\[ \epsilon_{\text{nucleon}} \approx 450 \text{ MeV/fm}^3 \]

A. Bazavov et al. (hotQCD), Phys. Rev. D90 (2014) 094503
Crossover transition parameters

PDG: Particle Data Group hadron spectrum

\[ T_c = (154 \pm 9) \text{ MeV} \]

\[ \epsilon_c = (0.34 \pm 0.16) \text{GeV/fm}^3 \]

A. Bazavov et al. (hotQCD), *The chiral and deconfining aspects of the QCD transition*, Phys. Rev. D85, 054503 (2012) (369 cit.)

compare with:

\[ \epsilon_{\text{nucl. mat.}} \approx 150 \text{ MeV/fm}^3 \]

\[ \epsilon_{\text{nucleon}} \approx 450 \text{ MeV/fm}^3 \]
Chiral Transition

\[ T_c = (154 \pm 9) \text{ MeV} \]

- near zero modes have well localized eigenstates
- consistent with instanton gas model
- UA(1) remains broken also above T_c

V. Dick et al, arXiv:1502.06190

M.I. Buchoff et al (hotQCD), PR D89, 094503 (2014)
Chiral Transition

UA(1) remains broken at T_c
T. Bhattacharya (hotQCD) PRL 113, 082001 (2014)

\[ m_\pi \approx 200 \text{ MeV}, \frac{(\chi_\pi^{\overline{MS}} - \chi_3^{\overline{MS}})}{T^2} \]
\[ m_\pi \approx 135 \text{ MeV}, \frac{(\chi_\pi^{\overline{MS}} - \chi_3^{\overline{MS}})}{T^2} \]

fate of UA(1) breaking and thus also the chiral phase transition in the massless (chiral) limit of QCD remains to be an unsolved textbook problem of QCD

V. Dick et al, arXiv:1502.06190

domain wall fermions

M.I. Buchoff et al (hotQCD), PR D89, 094503 (2014)
Explore the **structure of matter** close to the QCD transition temperature using **fluctuations of conserved charges**

– probing the response of a thermal medium to an external field, i.e. variation of one of its external control parameters: $T$, $\mu$, $m_q$

(generalized) response functions == (generalized) susceptibilities

\[
\frac{p}{T^4} \equiv \frac{1}{VT^3} \ln Z(V, T, \mu_B, Q, S, m_{u,d,s})
\]

- particle number density
- quark number susceptibility
- 4th order cumulant

\[
\chi_1^q = \frac{1}{VT^3} \frac{\partial \ln Z}{\partial \mu_q/T}
\]

\[
\langle \delta N_X \rangle \equiv \langle N_X - N_{\bar{X}} \rangle
\]

\[
\chi_2^q = \frac{1}{VT^3} \frac{\partial^2 \ln Z}{\partial (\mu_q/T)^2}
\]

\[
\sigma_X^2 \equiv \langle (\delta N_X)^2 \rangle - \langle \delta N_X \rangle^2
\]

\[
\chi_4^q = \frac{1}{VT^3} \frac{\partial^4 \ln Z}{\partial (\mu_q/T)^4}
\]

\[
\kappa_X \sigma_X^4 \equiv \langle (\delta N_X)^4 \rangle - 3\sigma_X^4
\]

**generalized quark number susceptibilities:**

\[
\chi_{ijk}^{BQS} = \frac{\partial^{i+j+k} p/T^4}{\partial \hat{\mu}_B \partial \hat{\mu}_Q \partial \hat{\mu}_S}
\]

\[
\hat{\mu}_X \equiv \mu_X / T
\]
Evidence for many charmed baryons in thermodynamics

close to $T_c$ charmed baryon fluctuations are about 50% larger than expected in a HRG based on known charmed baryon resonances (PDG-HRG)

all charmed baryons/mesons
charged charmed baryons/mesons
strange charmed baryons/mesons

including resonances predicted in quark model calculations and observed in lattice QCD calculations allows for a HRG model (QM-HRG) description of lattice QCD results on conserved charge fluctuations and correlations

Analyzing **strangeness carrier** with higher order cumulants

**$T > T_c$**: Is strangeness carried by quasi-particles with quantum numbers of quarks?

\[
\frac{\chi_{BQS}^{BQS}}{\chi_{121}^{BQS}} = \begin{cases} 
-1, & T \to \infty \\
\text{HRG}, & T \leq T_c 
\end{cases}
\]

ratio of properly weighted charged, strange baryons

**$T < T_c$**: Who carries strangeness in the HRG?

significant deviations from a HRG based on known resonances (PDG-HRG)

Enhanced strange baryon fluctuations:
inductions for more strange hadron resonances as predicted in quark model calculations (QM-HRG)

A. Bazavov et al.,
Freeze-out parameter from conserved charge fluctuations

Cumulant ratios of electric charge fluctuations

\[ S_Q \sigma_Q^3 / M_Q \]

\[ \mu_B/T = 0.0 \quad \text{red} \]
\[ \mu_B/T = 1.0 \quad \text{green} \]
\[ \mu_B/T = 1.3 \quad \text{yellow} \]

STAR: \( \sqrt{s} = 62.4 \text{ GeV} \)

\[ R_{12} \]

\[ R_{31} \]

T [MeV]

M_Q / \sigma_Q^2

LQCD: T = 150(5) MeV

STAR

HRG: hadron yield

\( \sqrt{s} \) [GeV]: 39

200

62.4

19.6

determines freeze-out chemical potential

\[ T_f \approx (150 \pm 5) \text{ MeV} \]

constrains freeze-out temperature

BI-BNL, PRL 109, 192302 (2012)
S. Mukherjee, M. Wagner, PoS CPOD2013 (2013) 039
Exploring the QCD phase diagram with net charge fluctuations

RHIC beam energy scan: $\sqrt{s} = (7.7 - 200)\text{GeV}/A$

search for the critical point

preparing for BES-II: 2019/20

want to understand properties of matter in the range

$$0.8 \leq \frac{T}{T_c} \leq 2$$
$$0 \leq \frac{\mu_B}{T} \leq 3$$

– equation of state
– crossover line
– critical point?
– freeze-out line
– transport properties
– in-medium hadron properties
Exploring the QCD phase diagram with net charge fluctuations

RHIC beam energy scan: $\sqrt{s} = (7.7 - 200) \text{GeV} / A$

**search for the critical point**

need to know the EoS at non-zero $T, \mu_B, \mu_S$

(BNL-Bielefeld-CCNU)

**generalized susceptibilities**

$$\chi_q^n = \frac{\partial^n p/T^4}{\partial(\mu_q/T)^n}$$

$q = B, Q, S$

**crossover line:** $T_c(\mu_B, \mu_S)$

(BNL-Bielefeld-CCNU)

– coefficients in the Taylor expansion of the Equation of State

– higher order cumulants of net-charge (B,Q,S) fluctuations measured in the BES at RHIC

need to know the properties of charge fluctuations at $T_f$

(HotQCD)
Equation of state of (2+1)-flavor QCD: $\mu_B/T > 0$

Ambitious Goal: **EoS in the entire parameter range accessible to the BES@RHIC**

$$\frac{P}{T^4} = \sum_{i,j,k=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{i!j!k!} \chi_{BQ_2}^{BQ_2} (T) \left( \frac{\mu_B}{T} \right)^i \left( \frac{\mu_Q}{T} \right)^j \left( \frac{\mu_S}{T} \right)^k$$

the simplest case: $\mu_S = \mu_Q = 0$

$$\frac{\Delta(T, \mu_B)}{T^4} = \frac{P(T, \mu_B) - P(T, 0)}{T^4} = \frac{\chi_2^B}{2} \left( \frac{\mu_B}{T} \right)^2 \left( 1 + \frac{1}{12} \frac{\chi_4^B}{\chi_2^B} \left( \frac{\mu_B}{T} \right)^2 \right)$$

$\Delta(T, \mu_B)$: variance of net-baryon number distribution

$\kappa_B \sigma_B^2$: kurtosis*variance

**work in progress**: report at Quark Matter 2014

P. Hegde (BNL-Bielefeld-CCNU), *The equation of state at $\mathcal{O}(\mu_B^4)$*

EoS at $\mu_B/T > 0$: Current status

$$\frac{\Delta(T, \mu_B)}{T^4} = \frac{P(T, \mu_B) - P(T, 0)}{T^4} = \frac{\chi_2^B}{2} \left( \frac{\mu_B}{T} \right)^2 \left( 1 + \frac{1}{12} \frac{\chi_4^B}{\chi_2^B} \left( \frac{\mu_B}{T} \right)^2 \right)$$

estimating the $O((\mu_B/T)^6)$ correction:

$$\sim \frac{1}{720} \frac{\chi_6^B}{\chi_2^B} \left( \frac{\mu_B}{T} \right)^6$$

The EoS is well controlled for $\mu_B/T \leq 2$. 
Conserved charge fluctuations and freeze-out

**net baryon number fluctuations**

STAR Collaboration, PRL 112, 032302 (2014)

**new STAR preliminary data and error projection for BES-II**

X. Luo (for STAR), CPOD2014 (2015) 019

\[
(S\sigma)_{\text{proton}} \equiv \frac{\chi_3^P}{\chi_2^P}
\]

\[
(\kappa\sigma^2)_{\text{proton}} \equiv \frac{\chi_4^P}{\chi_2^P}
\]
Conserved charge fluctuations and freeze-out

\[
\frac{\Delta(T, \mu_B)}{T^4} = \frac{P(T, \mu_B) - P(T, 0)}{T^4} = \frac{\chi_2^B}{2} \left( \frac{\mu_B}{T} \right)^2 \left( 1 + \frac{1}{12} \frac{\chi_4^B}{\chi_2^B} \left( \frac{\mu_B}{T} \right)^2 \right)
\]

\[
\frac{M_B}{\sigma_B^2} = \frac{\mu_B}{T} + \mathcal{O}(\mu_B^3)
\]

\[
S_B \sigma_B = \frac{\mu_B}{T} \frac{\chi_4^B}{\chi_2^B} + \mathcal{O}(\mu_B^3)
\]

\[
S_B \sigma_B = \frac{M_B \chi_4^B}{\sigma_B^2 \chi_2^B} + \mathcal{O}(\mu_B^3)
\]

warning: net-proton ≠ net-baryon
M. Kitazawa et al., PR C86 (2012) 024904
A. Bzdak et al., PR C87 (2013) 014901
Conserved charge fluctuations and freeze-out

Next order: depends on $6^{th}$ order cumulants and requires knowledge on the parametrization of the freeze-out curve, eg.

$$T_f(\mu_B) = T_f(0) \left(1 - \kappa_f \left(\frac{\mu_B}{T}\right)^2\right)$$

ratio of cumulants on "a line" in the $(T, \mu_B)$ plane

$$\frac{M_B}{\sigma_B^2} = \frac{\mu_B}{T} \frac{1 + \frac{1}{6} \frac{\chi_4^B}{\chi_2^B} \left(\frac{\mu_B}{T}\right)^2}{1 + \frac{1}{2} \frac{\chi_4^B}{\chi_2^B} \left(\frac{\mu_B}{T}\right)^2}$$

$$S_B\sigma_B = \frac{\mu_B}{T} \frac{\chi_4^B}{\chi_2^B} \frac{1 + \frac{1}{6} \frac{\chi_6^B}{\chi_4^B} \left(\frac{\mu_B}{T}\right)^2}{1 + \frac{1}{2} \frac{\chi_4^B}{\chi_2^B} \left(\frac{\mu_B}{T}\right)^2}$$

$$\equiv \left(\frac{\chi_4^B}{\chi_2^B}\right)_{T_f(0)} - \kappa_f T_f(0) \left(\frac{\chi_4^B}{\chi_2^B}\right)' \left(\frac{\mu_B}{T}\right)^2$$
Heavy Quark spectroscopy, thermal dileptons, transport coefficients

CMS Collaboration, PRL 109, 222301 (2012)


BNL-Bi, arXiv:1301.7436


W. Cassing et al., arXiv:1302.0906
Advancing the development of software needed for QCD thermodynamics calculations

NP SciDAC-3 project: Computing Properties of Hadrons, Nuclei and Nuclear Matter from Quantum Chromodynamics (LQCD) (BNL, Jlab, LLNL, MIT, UNC, UoW, W&M)

NERSC Exascale Science Application Program:
Domain Wall Fermions and Highly Improved Staggered Quarks for Lattice QCD, N. Christ (Columbia U.), F. Karsch (BNL)

– optimization and improvement of inverters

– code optimization for BlueGene/Q, GPU-clusters (+Titan@ORNL), INTEL's Knights Corner and Knights Landing
Calculating charge fluctuations on the lattice

**recent advances:**

– understood that higher order cumulants are free of divergences and can be calculated using the so-called **linear-mu formulation**: R.V. Gavai and S. Sharma, Phys. Rev. D85 (2012) 054508

– developed **efficient deflation code** for the evaluation of charge fluctuation observables on GPUs
Calculating charge fluctuations on the lattice

- highly efficient CG inverter for HISQ action on GPUs (and also on MIC)


SciDAC-3 visiting grad.student at BNL

- gain by using **multiple right hand sides**
- **Titan specific**: shift eigenvector calculation for deflation to CPU; generation of eigenvectors "comes for free" and GPU can run with more right hand sides
Conclusions

During the last 5 years LGT calculations have achieved two important goals: determination of $T_c$ and calculation of the equation of state with physical quark masses in the continuum limit.

LGT calculations start to produce quantitative predictions on QCD thermodynamics that provide input to the interpretation of heavy ion experiments:

- EoS, $T_c$, transport coefficients, spectral functions, phase boundary, fluctuations of conserved charges,....

The next five years – before BES-II at RHIC

- Lattice QCD will provide the EoS in the entire parameter range relevant for BES-II at RHIC (if no critical point exists in that range)

- Lattice QCD will strengthen evidence for a critical point (if it exists in the parameter range accessible to BES-II at RHIC)